



Primary Education and Participatory Citizenship in Pakistan: Insights from Punjab Textbooks

Sidra Saeed¹, Dr. Tazanfal Tehseem², Tarim Masood³

¹MPhil Scholar, Department of English Language and Linguistics, University of Sargodha, Punjab Pakistan,

Email: sidrasaeed244@gmail.com

²Associate Professor, Department of English Language and Linguistics, University of Sargodha, Punjab Pakistan,

Email: tazanfal.tehseem@uos.edu.pk

³Visiting Lecturer, Department of English Language and Linguistics, University of Sargodha, Punjab Pakistan,

Email: tarimmasood42@gmail.com

ARTICLE INFO

Article History:

Received: March 06, 2026

Revised: April 05, 2026

Accepted: April 13, 2026

Available Online: April 20, 2026

Keywords:

Participatory Citizenship, Primary Education, Textbooks, Civic Education, Inclusivity

Corresponding Author:

Dr. Tazanfal Tehseem

Email:

tazanfal.tehseem@uos.edu.pk

ABSTRACT

This study looks at how Primary Education textbooks in Punjab Pakistan help students become citizens. The study uses a research design to examine selected textbooks and see how they teach civic responsibilities, inclusiveness, and democratic engagement through language and content. The research is based on Paulo Freire's *Critical Pedagogy* and Ingrid Piller's *Content Analysis* framework to evaluate Punjab Curriculum and Textbook Board textbooks for Grades 5 and 6. The findings show that these textbooks promote awareness, moral values, inclusivity, gender equality and community engagement. However, some lessons still teach citizenship and highlight challenges like corruption, social inequality and lack of resources, which can reduce students' active involvement in society. Overall the study suggests that textbooks can be tools for social change but improvements are needed to increase inclusivity, participatory learning activities, and critical thinking skills so students can become better prepared for active citizenship in Pakistan.

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.59075/tamsaal.v4i4.137>



© 2026 The Authors, Published by ULLR. This is an Open Access Article under the Creative Common Attribution ([CC-BY 4.0](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/))

Introduction

Citizenship education is very important in today's societies. Many countries face challenges like inequality, marginalization, and a decline in civic engagement. Education plays a role in helping individuals become responsible, active and informed citizens. Democratic and inclusive citizenship education focuses on understanding rights and responsibilities as well as fostering critical thinking, social responsibility, and meaningful participation in civic life (Wood et al., 2018; Freeman-Green et al., 2023)

In the world, civic education is crucial for fostering democratic principles and encouraging young people to engage in political processes. Studies show that effective citizenship education provides learners with the knowledge, skills and values necessary to become active participants in democratic societies (Morales, 2024; Stolle & Harell, 2013). However, civic values and forms of participation vary across countries and cultures, influencing how individuals take part in civic life (Putnam, 2015; Banting & Kymlicka, 2017).

School curricula and textbooks play a role in shaping students' civic attitudes and understanding of social responsibility. Textbooks are a core element of classroom instruction. They have a strong influence on learners' beliefs, behaviors and perceptions of society. (Sadker & Zittleman, 2007; Mkuchu, 2004). This research analyzes textbooks developed by the Punjab Curriculum and Textbook Board (PCTB), which are different from international textbooks. While international textbooks focus on global perspectives and abstract critical thinking, Punjab textbooks are locally oriented and aligned with Pakistan's socio-cultural and national context. They emphasize national identity, ethical values, and fundamental civic duties.

This study is based on the ideas of Critical Pedagogy (Freire, 1970) and guided by perspectives on *Linguistic Diversity and Social Justice* (Piller, 2016). The research analyzes primary-level English textbooks for Grades 5 and 6 to see how they teach participatory citizenship.

The study aims to evaluate the potential of textbooks to prepare students for participation in Pakistan's democracy.

Research Objectives

The study deals with the following research objectives:

1. To examine how textbooks, encourage students to engage more actively in their communities and government.
2. To assess the representation of diverse perspectives in textbooks to foster inclusivity and tolerance among students.

Research Questions

This study adopts a qualitative, data-driven approach to analyze how primary education textbooks construct participatory citizenship through language and content. The research framework allows the researcher to develop interpretations of civic values, inclusivity, and democratic participation as represented in the selected textbooks. To achieve these objectives, the study is guided by the following research questions:

1. To what extent do textbooks promote actual involvement of learners in democratic processes such as civic sense, voting, and political debates?
2. How the content related to participatory citizenship does promote gender equality, anti-racism, and address marginalization?

Significance of the Study

This research is important for educators, policymakers, and researchers who are interested in the role of education in promoting democratic participation. By analyzing the representation of civic values, inclusivity, and diversity in Punjab's primary-level English textbooks, the study sheds light on how these materials contribute to shaping students' civic attitudes.

Literature Review

Citizenship education is an element of democratic societies. It aims to equip students for participation in civic and political life. Participatory citizenship emphasizes the involvement of individuals in decision-making processes, community activities (Council of Europe, 2003, as cited in Simovska & Jensen, 2009). A democratic society requires citizens who participate in actions to achieve social justice and equality (Wertheimer & Kahne, 2004).

Citizenship is something that has been explained in different ways. Most people think of it is a status that is confirmed by a person's national documents, like a passport, which shows that the person belongs to a specific country (Bellamy, 2008; Stewart, 1995). Active citizenship is not just about knowing your rights and responsibilities. It is also about taking part in making society better. Many scholars think that encouraging people to be citizens, from a young age is important. They believe it helps develop values. It also helps reduce marginalization. It promotes tolerance and inclusivity. The components of citizenship include these values. This study will look at whether textbooks promote these components in schools.

Education is really important for getting people to take part in their communities especially when kids are in school and they are figuring out who they are and what it means to be a citizen. At this stage, education about being a citizen teaches students the basics they need to know to be involved in democracy like how to think critically, work together, and appreciate people who are different from them (Levine, 2011; Giroux, 2013). However, some studies have found that citizenship education is often just about learning facts and does not always lead to people getting involved in their communities especially if students do not get to take part in activities that teach them about democracy in a hands-on way, at school (Comber, 2005).

Textbooks play a significant role in helping students learn about citizenship. This is especially important in developing countries, where textbooks often serve as the primary source of instruction. Scholars argue that textbooks represent the visible part of what students learn in school. They also provide a means for students to get knowledge and learn social values (Georgescu, Bernard, & Peterson, 2007). Previous research shows that textbooks do more than simply provide factual information. They also teach students values, what to believe and how to behave. These things help shape student's ideas about being a citizen, who they are and how they should take part in society (Van Dijk, 2006). In Pakistan, school curricula and textbooks mostly focus on national identity, patriotism, and personal values. However, they do not focus on teaching students about being active and involved citizens who make decisions in a fair way (Saigol, n.d.; Dean, 2005).

The study by Butt, Abid, Iqbal, and Arooj (2019) shows that Pakistani textbooks focus on values like being patriotic and disciplined. They also talk about being compassionate, kind to others, and responsible. However, Pakistani textbooks do not really discuss how to make decisions or

how to have a good debate about politics. They also do not teach students how to be active in their community. This means that students do not get to learn how to participate in their community. It also means that students are more likely to follow rules without questioning them. Moreover, the way students are taught in Pakistan is also a problem. Pakistani students are often just asked to memorize things for a test. This type of teaching does not help students become thoughtful citizens. Pakistani textbooks and the way students are taught do not help students develop critical thinking skills.

Citizenship education is really important. It needs to include everyone. We have to make sure that everyone is represented and treated fairly. This is what we call inclusivity. When we have citizenship education it helps to make things equal for men and women. It also helps to stop people from being treated and gives a voice to people who are often ignored (Polat, 2011). However, when we look at textbooks from Pakistan we see that they still do not treat men and women equally. Women are often shown doing household work and being bossed around, while men are shown doing jobs and being leaders (Agha et al., 2018; Khattak, 2018). These images in the textbooks teach students that men are more important than women, which is not fair. Citizenship education should teach students about equality and fairness. The textbooks, in Pakistan are not doing a good job of this.

Similarly, research on religious groups in textbooks shows that people from minority groups are often left out or treated unfairly. This means that textbooks only show one side of what it means to be part of a country (Zahra et al., 2025). Textbooks usually support the idea of the people in charge by talking about what the majority thinks and ignoring the different cultures that exist. This makes it hard to teach people about treating everyone and being a good citizen no matter what they look like or where they come from as people (Mirza, 2004; Naseem, 2008).

Language plays a role in making social biases stronger or weaker in textbooks. Research on sociolinguistics and critical discourse shows that the way we choose words can affect how much power people have and make unfair treatment seem normal through stories that appear neutral (Luke, 1995; Lazar, 2005). In Pakistan people still use language that is specific to males and females, and they only show certain things in textbooks. This helps keep social rules and it does not let everyone participate equally (Gul & Nayab, 2025).

People have done a lot of research on teaching learners about being citizens, gender bias and how some groups are treated unfairly. However, not many studies in Pakistan have looked at English textbooks used in primary schools in Punjab to see how they teach learners about being active citizens in a democratic society. Most of the time researchers look at what the government says schools should teach or they look at what happens in colleges and universities. They do not often think about how the words and pictures in textbooks can help learners about being citizens and working together. So this study is going to look at the textbooks used by students in grades 5 and 6 in Punjab to see how they teach students about democracy treating equally and being fair to all people, especially girls and boys and people from different backgrounds, which are the key aspects of participatory citizenship.

Methodology and Framework

This study is about how people work as citizens in a community. It looks at primary-level English textbooks used in schools in Punjab, Pakistan. The study checks what kind of language

and themes are used in these textbooks to teach students about civic values, democratic participation, inclusivity, gender representation, and marginalization. The study uses textbooks from Grades 5 and 6 that were made by the Punjab Curriculum and Textbook Board. At first, the study looked at a lot of passages of the textbooks. Then it picked seven passages to look at closely. Three from Grade 5 and four from Grade 6. The study of textbooks, in Punjab Pakistan is important to understand how participatory citizenship is represented. The English textbooks are used to teach students about values and democratic participation. The study of textbooks looks at how they show inclusivity and gender representation. The study also looks at how English textbooks deal with marginalization.

The research uses qualitative content analysis to examine how selected reading passages, conversations, exercises and pictures represent civic engagement, democratic participation, and inclusivity. The analysis explores how these materials portray student's participation in their communities, democratic processes, and the inclusion of diverse groups. A data-driven approach is used to identify themes that are relevant to the research objectives. These themes include civic participation, democratic values, gender equality, anti-racism, representation of marginalized communities, and the promotion of critical thinking. The researcher analyzes the words used in the textbooks by examining both what they say directly and what they imply to identify the underlying ideas and patterns.

The study is based on Critical Pedagogy, which was an idea developed by Freire in (1970). This idea says that education should help learners ask questions about things that are not fair in society. The study also uses ideas from Linguistic Diversity and Social Justice which was discussed by Piller in (2016). Linguistic Diversity and Social Justice helps us understand how language can affect who has power, who is included and who is left out. By looking at these ideas and carefully reading what is in primary-level textbooks in Punjab, the study checks if these textbooks help students become citizens or if they just teach students to sit and listen.

Discussion and Analysis

Grade 5 Textbook

Passage: 1 Unit, 1 Patience

“Azlan, Ayesha, Meerab, and Ali [...] group members [...] make a project [...] traits of Rasoolullah (S.A.W) [...] Azlan was to write on patience [...] everyone except Azlan [...] completed [...] on time [...] delay in writing [...] misbehaved [...] hide his laziness [...] late [...] Ayesha [...] patient [...] share a book [...] help him finish his part.” (Punjab Curriculum & Textbook Board, p. 2)

In this paragraph, students were given a project on the personality traits of the Holy Prophet (S.A.W). Azlan was assigned to write on patience, but he delayed his work and responded negatively when asked. In contrast, Ayesha remained calm and assisted him in completing his part by sharing her book.

Coding and Categorization

- Group Members → Volunteering, Civic Engagement

- Project + Write → Civic Education, Participatory Citizenship, Civic Practice
- Patience + Help → Moral Citizenship, Civic Disposition, Civic Sense
- Delay + Misbehaved + Hide + Laziness → Lack of Civic Skills and Values

Freire's Critical Pedagogy

Freire's Concepts	Implication in the Passage
Banking Model of Education	Students are learning about patience and the advantages of teamwork.
Dialogic Learning	Students' participation and volunteering is encouraged.
Critical Consciousness	Students can critically think about how to be patient and avoid anger issues in different situations.
Praxis (Reflection + Action)	Participatory citizenship promotes civic engagement, civic sense, dispositions, and civic education.

Interpretation and Analysis

The passage emphasizes group work or teamwork among students. It promotes civic values such as cooperation, responsibility, patience, and respect, while also highlighting honesty and tolerance as these are the key characteristics of good citizenship. It further reflects inclusivity and gender equality through equal participation of all group members. From a Critical Pedagogy perspective, the activity encourages collaboration and value-based learning. However, it mainly focuses on moral conduct and provides limited opportunities for developing critical thinking or active democratic participation.

Passage 1: Unit 3, Women as Role Models

"History [...] role models [...] women [...] great support for men [...] equal in terms of spirit, hard work, achievement [...] Miss Fatima Jinnah [...] helped her brother in Pakistan Movement [...] inspiration [...] Maadar-e-Millat [...] Dr. Ruth Pfau [...] rescue patients [...] Arfa Abdul Kareem [...] pride of our country [...] represent various prestigious technology related events [...] Samina Khayal Baig [...] first Pakistani women to climb Mount Everest [...] first Muslim lady to climb all Seven Summits [...] her brother supported and guided her [...] achieve their goals." (Punjab Curriculum & Textbook Board, pp. 26-27)

This paragraph highlights the importance of women in the country's progress. They are hardworking and great supporters of men and help building a strong nation. The Pakistani history is full of strong women such as Fatima Jinnah, Dr. Ruth Pfau, Arfa Abdul Kareem, Samina Khayal Baig, and many others. All these women have played a great role in bringing Pakistan to the world.

Coding and Categorization

- Role Model + Inspiration → Community Service, Political Engagement, Democratic Values
- Equal + Pride + Prestigious → Social Justice, Anti-Racism
- Help + Rescue + Guided + Support → Voting, Participatory Citizenship

- Hard Work + Achievement + Goals → Sportsmanship, Civic Sense

Freire's Critical Pedagogy

Freire's Concepts	Implication in the Passage
Banking Model of Education	Students are taught about the true spirit of sportsmanship.
Dialogic Learning	Students are encouraged to take an active part in their learning and community activities.
Critical Consciousness	The active and critical thinking of students is important in recognizing how hard work pays off.
Praxis (Reflection + Action)	The purpose of participatory citizenship is to foster civic and political engagement, sportsmanship, and social equality.

Interpretation and Analysis

The text talks about the things that women from Pakistan have achieved in different areas. It shows that they can do well when they are given the same chances as others. It shows women like Fatima Jinnah, Dr. Ruth Pfau, Arfa Kareem, and Samina Baig as great examples of hard work and success. Their achievements show how important it is for girls and women to get an education and how much they contribute to society. The text also encourages people to believe in treatment for everyone, to be inclusive, and to respect the rights of all people. It asks students to see the roles that women play in society. From the point of view of Critical Pedagogy, the text helps to create active and involved citizens by making people think about fairness, taking responsibility, for society, and being part of the community.

Passage 1, Unit 11, Let's Be Helpful

"[...] friends [...] same school [...] we gather in park [...] teacher announced [...] arrange a fun fair [...] we are excited [...] Sara was not happy [...] remained quiet [...] did not participate in discussion [...] her father lost his job [...] walked away sadly [...] speechless [...] Maheen, Abdullah, and Tahir thought [...] make Sara happy [...] save our pocket money [...] did not waste money [...] collected [...] buy a new dress for Sara [...] surprised to see gift [...] delight and gratitude [...] thanked [...] sharing bring happiness [...] take care of each other." (Punjab Curriculum & Textbook Board, pp. 110-111)

This unit narrates the story of four friends Maheen, Sara, Abdullah, and Tahir who attend the same school and spend their free time together. The announcement of a fun fair brings excitement to all the students except Sara, who remains silent. She later discloses that her father has lost his job, and as a result, she cannot purchase a new dress for the fun fair. After hearing about her situation, her friends collectively agree to save their money and buy a dress for her. She feels deeply grateful and appreciative of her friends' kindness. The unit emphasizes the importance of friendship, empathy, kindness, and helping individuals who are facing hardship.

Coding and Categorization

- Gather + Thought + Friends + Sharing + Take Care → Community Service, Volunteering

- Save + Collected + Did not Waste → Democratic Values, Civic Responsibility, Civic Education
- Delight + Happiness + Gratitude + Thanked → Civic Dispositions, Civic Values
- Values

Freire's Critical Pedagogy

Freire's Concepts	Implication in the Passage
Banking Model of Education	Students are developing a sense of responsibility, respect for others, and a willingness to help one another during difficult times.
Dialogic Learning	Students' participation and opinions are valued.
Critical Consciousness	Students can learn how to support others and bring happiness to their lives.
Praxis (Reflection + Action)	Active participation in community affairs promotes a sense of civic responsibility and social awareness.

Interpretation and Analysis

The passage promotes values of friendship, mutual support, and community building through acts of helping others. It develops civic values including empathy, cooperation, social responsibility, and sharing, emphasizing the importance of supporting others in the community. It promotes community cooperation and highlights the contribution of individuals in developing a caring and supportive environment. From the lens of Critical Pedagogy, it reflects students' understanding of social responsibility and their role in contributing to the community. However, it primarily emphasizes moral behavior and does not provide deeper critical engagement with social problems such as poverty and inequality.

Grade 6 Textbook

Passage 2: Unit 5, Harmony in Society

"Jasim [...] had polio [...] developed a phobia of school [...] bullied by a few naughty boys [...] Haziq and Ahmad heard everything with concern [...] wished to see Jasim in a normalized situation [...] they greeted him [...] offered him chocolates [...] reluctant in accepting the offer of friendship [...] did not refuse their company [...] promised him [...] be at his side in all difficult situation [...] people look [...] differently able citizen [...] friendship became famous [...] others joined [...] should be thankful to Allah [...] our moral duty [...] treat with empathy [...] change in society [...] society become better." (Punjab Curriculum & Textbook Board, pp. 48-49)

This passage describes how Ahmad and Haziq met Jasim, a neighbor who has polio. Jasim had to stop going to school because the other kids were mean to him. Ahmad and Haziq were really nice to Jasim. They wanted to be his friends and include him in their games. At first, Jasim was not sure about this. Ahmad and Haziq kept being kind and encouraging him. They helped Jasim when the other kids were not nice to him. Ahmad, Haziq and Jasim became friends. This helped the other kids see that Jasim is a person too. The other kids started to play with Jasim and be friends with him. Ahmad and Haziq showed everyone that Jasim is, like them.

Coding and Categorization

- Bullied + Naughty → Lack of Citizenship, Social Inequality
- Concern → Sense of Responsibility, Critical Thinking
- Greet + Offer friendship → Civic Skills
- Promise to be at his side → Moral education, Citizenship
- Differently able → Social Learning (socially acceptable term)
- Others joined → Engagement, Participation
- Thankful + Our moral duty + empathy → Institutional Education, Moral Citizenships

Freire's Critical Pedagogy

Freire's Concepts	Implication in the Passage
Banking Model of Education	Students can observe and think critically and logically about their surroundings.
Dialogic Learning	Students' concern, voice, and interaction is encouraged.
Critical Consciousness	Students help each other and work together to create a positive and inclusive learning environment.
Praxis (Reflection + Action)	Education/Pedagogy helps people develop moral values, think critically, and become responsible citizens.

Interpretation and Analysis

The analysis shows that bad behavior can really hurt people and make them feel sad and upset. It is very important for people to learn about being a citizen and doing the right thing so everyone is treated fairly and has the same chances. The passage talks about how we should treat each other with kindness and respect and be responsible for helping others. It also says we should work together and help each other. The term "abled boy" is a nice way of saying that everyone is different and that is okay. It helps people accept and appreciate each other's differences. This way of thinking also helps students learn to think for themselves and become citizens who care about what happens in their community. From the perspective of Critical Pedagogy, the passage says we should all try to be good citizens by being kind and respectful to people who are often treated unfairly. However, the passage mostly focuses on teaching people to be good. It does not critically examine the causes of discrimination and social exclusion. Civic and moral education is really important for reducing inequality and discrimination and for fostering inclusion and the passage reflects the development of civic values including empathy, respect for equality, kindness and a sense of social responsibility.

Passage 3: Unit 7, Corruption

"An unusual phone call [...] son met with accident [...] rushed to hospital [...] large crowd of poor workers and laborers [...] devastating din [...] central bridge of city had fallen [...] he ordered [...] use poor material [...] son was victim of bridge collapse [...] people were cursing him [...] Mr. Shan sought forgiveness [...] regretted his acts [...] appearance of doctor [...] fake medical certificate [...] issued by his signature [...] misdeeds and wrong acts [...] in front of him [...] ashamed and repentant [...] sad news of son's death [...] his own dishonesty and misuse of power [...] corruption [...] nation's downfall [...] destroy society [...] must be honest [...] show loyalty and responsibility." (Punjab Curriculum & Textbook Board, pp. 70-71)

This passage tells the story of Mr. Shan, whose misuse of power leads to a tragedy following the collapse of a poorly constructed bridge that causes his son's death. The incident illustrates the negative outcomes of corruption and unethical choices. The unit presents a moral lesson emphasizing honesty, accountability, and loyalty to oneself and others.

Coding and Categorization

- Devastating din + Victim + Curse + Fake → Injustice, Victimization, Social Inequality
- Misdeeds + Wrong acts + Dishonesty + Misuse of power → Lack of Morality
- Corruption + Downfall + Destroy → Dictatorship, Uncivil, Deterioration
- Ashamed + Repentance + Forgiveness + Regret → Civic Sense, Moral Guidance
- Honest + Loyal + Responsibility → Participatory Citizenship, Institutional Education

Freire's Critical Pedagogy

Freire's Concept	Implication in the Passage
Banking Model of Education	Students are given education on the civic skills and participatory citizenship.
Dialogic Learning	The interaction between the students is encouraged.
Critical Consciousness	Students are taught how to be a good citizens.
Praxis (Reflection + Action)	Active participatory citizenship promotes civic sense and moral education.

Interpretation and Analysis

This paragraph portrays the concept of divine justice, as Mr. Shan's corruption and abuse of authority lead to his downfall. He prioritized his own family and sought to improve their lifestyle through corruption; however, divine justice had a different outcome. The hidden curriculum of the paragraph emphasizes the need for honesty and loyalty. From the perspective of Critical Pedagogy, participatory citizenship demands honesty, loyalty, and a sense of responsibility. The absence of moral values and the misuse of power can lead to the destruction of both society and the nation. Students are therefore guided to develop a critical understanding of moral values, social norms, civic responsibility, inclusivity, and democracy. However, it mainly conveys a moral lesson and does not critically examine broader systemic issues such as corruption and misuse of power.

Passage 2: Unit 9, Education is my Right

"Ameena [...] reading an old book [...] faced challenges [...] access to education [...] poverty [...] find old books from scrap [...] mother supported and encouraged her to read [...] no school for girls [...] Mr. Akbar appreciated [...] spirit of learning [...] promised to facilitate [...] Ameena's parents arranged a meeting [...] Mr. Akbar encouraged villagers to send their kids school [...] promised [...] teach without fee [...] gets book and stationery [...] students hardly increased [...] did not send their daughters [...] Ameena [...] only girl in school [...] sitting with boys was awkward [...] parents were willing [...] sake of education." (Punjab Curriculum & Textbook Board, p. 94)

This passage talks about the challenges faced by children who lack access to education, especially girls. It shows how Ameena is very determined to keep learning even though she

doesn't have things she needs. It also shows how her parents help her a lot. The text says that everyone should have the chance to go to school and get support from society. It also shows that there are still problems because of gender when it comes to education.

Coding and Categorization

- Reading + Education + Learning → Civic Skills, Civic Education, Civic Knowledge
- Challenges + No access + Poverty → Deprivation, Stereotypes
- Meeting → Volunteering, Civic Engagement
- Encouraged + Appreciated + Promised + Facilitate → Citizenship, Morality, Civic Practice
- Did not send girls to school → Gender Inequality, Lack of Critical Thinking

Freire's Critical Pedagogy

Freire's Concept	Implication in the Passage
Banking Model of Education	It is regarded as inappropriate to send girls to boys' schools because of the limited availability of girls' schools.
Dialogic Learning	Coeducation is not encouraged.
Critical Consciousness	Male-dominated systems and gender discrimination influence students' understanding of society and limit their ability to think critically.
Praxis (Reflection + Action)	Participatory citizenship encourages students to actively engage in their communities and develop awareness of issues that affect society.

Interpretation and Analysis

The passage discusses the challenges faced by girls from marginalized communities in getting education. It emphasizes that everyone should be treated fairly and have equal educational opportunities. It also draws attention to the importance of assisting socially and economically disadvantaged groups. It raises awareness of gender inequality and emphasizes the transformation of discriminatory social practices. From a Critical Pedagogy perspective, the text highlights equal educational access regardless of gender. It also reflects the importance of state involvement in resource provision. However, it largely outlines the issue with limited engagement with broader structural and policy-related concerns.

Passage 1: Unit 12, Good Citizen

“Shiza and Tania [...] responsible and obedient girls [...] always followed what their parents and teachers taught them [...] a lesson about good citizenship [...] teacher told them [...] a good citizen [...] imbibe obedience and responsibility.” (Punjab Curriculum & Textbook Board, p. 118)

In the passage, Shiza and Tania are shown as compliant and responsible students who follow the guidance of their elders, as their teacher stated that being a good citizen requires obedience and responsibility.

Coding and Categorization

- Obedient girls → Citizenship, Gendered Socialization, Passive Gendered Identity
- Followed authority → Authority Compliance, Passive Role, Civic Sense
- Lesson on good citizenship → Institutional definition of Citizenship, Civic Practice
- Obedient + Responsible → Moral Citizenship, Lack of Critical Thinking, Compliance

Freire's Critical Pedagogy

Freire's Concept	Implication in the Passage
Banking Model of Education	Knowledge is delivered to students without their input or reflection.
Dialogic Learning	Interaction, debate, or student voices are encouraged.
Critical Consciousness	Students are encouraged to think about power, inequality, and participation.
Praxis (Reflection + Action)	The concept of citizenship includes passive engagement in society.

Interpretation and Analysis

The passage describes citizenship as following rules, being responsible, and respecting those, in charge. The hidden message shows citizenship as just obeying without thinking. It encourages people to be quiet and not question things. The hidden curriculum also reinforces girls to be obedient and not ask questions. The whole text presents a strict idea of being a good citizen. This idea stops students from taking part in democracy. From a Critical Pedagogy view, this does not help students become stronger or think for themselves. It makes them follow rules, stay quiet, and obey without thinking.

Conclusion

This study looked at how primary-level English textbooks for Grades 5 and 6 in Punjab, Pakistan teach students about participatory citizenship. The study used a way of thinking called Critical Pedagogy to guide it and carefully looked at what the textbooks say. The findings show that these textbooks are really helpful for students in Punjab, Pakistan. They learn about civic values and ethical responsibilities. They also learn about being inclusive and having awareness when they are young. These textbooks are very useful for students, in Punjab, Pakistan to learn these things during the early years of education.

The findings indicate that textbooks are really good at helping students become citizens. They teach students to work together, care about others, and respect people from different backgrounds. The textbooks also encourage students to help others and become involved in their communities. Through various lessons, students learn about teamwork, compassion, and helping people in need. They also learn the importance of treating everyone fairly. This helps students understand what it means to be responsible citizens who care about their communities. The textbooks also include stories about women who serve as role models and highlight the challenges that some girls face when they try to get an education. This demonstrates the importance of promoting gender equality and ensuring that everyone is included. The textbooks

support the development of participatory citizenship by promoting values such as cooperation, respect for diversity, community involvement, inclusiveness, and helping others.

Although the textbooks promote a range of positive values, the study shows that they have some limitations. Much of the content focuses on encouraging students to be good individuals and follow social norms rather than preparing them to participate actively in democratic processes. They mainly emphasize moral values and socially acceptable behavior. Students do not get enough opportunities to develop critical thinking skills, understand how society works, discuss important issues, or take part in decision-making processes. Furthermore, issues such as inequality, poverty, disability, and corruption are discussed in school textbooks. However, these issues are mostly presented as problems that individuals should deal with rather than as wider social and systemic issues.

From the perspective of Critical Pedagogy, the textbooks promote basic citizenship values but provide limited opportunities for critical thinking, dialogue, and active participation. As a result, they do not fully support the development of active and democratic citizens.

In conclusion, the Grade 5 and 6 textbooks provide an understanding of civic values and inclusivity. However, they need more work to really encourage participatory citizenship. Adding more critical thinking activities that involve students in learning and a deeper look at social and political issues could make the textbooks better. This would help students to be active, knowledgeable, and responsible citizens, in Pakistan.

References

1. Agha, N., Syed, G. K., & Mirani, D. A. (2018). Exploring the Representation of Gender and Identity: Patriarchal and Citizenship Perspectives from the Primary Level Sindhi Textbooks in Pakistan. *Women's Studies International Forum*, 66, 17-24.
2. Banting, K., & Kymlicka, W. (2017). *The Strains of Commitment: The Political Sources of Solidarity in Diverse Societies*. Oxford University Press.
3. Bellamy, R. (2008). *Citizenship*. Oxford University Press.
4. Bustillos Morales, J. A. (2024). Youth Wordlessness and Civic Participation Online and at School: Exploring Arendt's Philosophy. *Journal of Civil Society*, 20(1), 93–108.
5. Butt, M., Abid, M. A., Iqbal, M., & Arooj, T. (2019). The Role of Urdu Curriculum in the Promotion of Civic Values among Students (With the Special Reference of 7th Grade Urdu Textbook). *Jahan-e-Tahqeeq*, 2(2), 15-27.
6. Comber, M. K. (2005). Civic Skills and Civic Education: An Empirical Assessment. *University of Maryland, College Park*.
7. Dean, B. L. (2005). Citizenship Education in Pakistani Schools: Problems and Possibilities. *International Journal of Citizenship and Teacher education*, 1(2), 35.
8. Freeman-Green, S., Williamson, P., & Cornelius, K. (2023). Promoting Inclusive Practices in Education: Bridging Gaps and Fostering Independence. *Teaching Exceptional Children*, 56(2), 68-69.
9. Freire, P. (1970). *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*. Penguin Books.
10. Giroux, H. (2013). Twilight of the Social: Civic Values in the Age of Casino Capitalism. *Civic Values & Civic Practices*, 13-18.
11. Georgescu, D., Bernard, J., & Peterson, C. (2007). *Thinking and Building Peace through Innovative Textbook Design: Report of the Inter-Regional Experts' Meeting on*

- Developing Guidelines for Promoting Peace and Intercultural Understanding Through Curricula, Textbooks, and Learning Materials*. Paris: UNESCO, Education Sector.
12. Gul, S. (2025). Language, Ideology, and Bias: A Sociolinguistic Examination of English Textbooks in Punjab. *Qlantic Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities*, 6(1), 418-426.
 13. Khattak, S. S. G. (2018). Revisiting Gender and Feminism: Global and Pakistani Perspectives. *Pakistan Journal of Gender Studies*, 17(1), 253-277.
 14. Lazar, M. M. (2005). *Feminist Critical Discourse Analysis: Gender, Power, and Ideology in Discourse*. Palgrave Macmillan.
 15. Levine, P. (2011). *The Oxford Handbook of Civil Society*. Oxford University Press.
 16. Luke, A. (1995). Text and Discourse in Education: An Introduction to Critical Discourse Analysis. *Review of Research in Education*, 21(1), 3–48.
 17. Mkuchu, S. G. V. (2004). *Gender Roles in Textbooks as a Function of Hidden Curriculum in Tanzania Primary Schools*. University of South Africa (South Africa).
 18. Piller, I. (2016). *Linguistic Diversity and Social Justice: An Introduction to Applied Sociolinguistics*. Oxford University Press.
 19. Polat, F. (2011). Inclusion in Education: A Step towards Social Justice. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 31(1), 50-58.
 20. Putnam, R. D. (2015). *Our Kids: The American Dream in Crisis*. Simon & Schuster.
 21. Sadker, D., & Zittleman, K. (2007). Gender Bias: From Colonial America. *Multicultural Education: Issues and Perspectives*, 137(7), 135-169.
 22. Saigol, R. (n.d.). Making of a Citizen Civic Education in Pakistan.
 23. Simovska, V., & Jensen, B. B. (2009). *Conceptualizing Participation: The Health of Children and Young People*. WHO, Regional Office for Europe.
 24. Stewart, A. (1995). Two Conceptions of Citizenship. *The British Journal of Sociology*, 46(1), 63- 78.
 25. Stolle, D., & Harell, A. (2013). The Effect of Trust in Government on Reported Voting Behavior: The Case of Canada. *Comparative Political Studies*, 46(11), 1427-1453.
 26. Van Dijk, T. A. (2006). Discourse and Manipulation. *Discourse & society*, 17(3), 359-383.
 27. Westheimer, J., & Kahne, J. (2004). What Kind of Citizen? The Politics of Educating for 197 Democracy. *American Education Research Journal*, 41(2), 237-269.
 28. Wood, B. E., Taylor, R., Atkins, R., & Johnston, M. (2018). Pedagogies for Active Citizenship: Learning through Affective and Cognitive Domains for Deeper Democratic Engagement. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 75, 259-267.
 29. Zahra, S. T., Ali, I., & Khalil, S. (2025). Silenced Minorities: A Semiotic Analysis of Religious and Ethnic Absence in Pakistan's Grade 5 English Textbook. *Journal of Media Horizons*, 6(2), 715-728.